Shared Governance and Middle States:
Institutional Learning Outcomes and General Education, Shared Governance past, present, and throughout the new standards

Deborah L. Moeckel, SUNY Assistant Provost
SUNY Voices
March 2, 2018
deborah.moeckel@suny.edu
What does Middle States have to say about Shared Governance?
2002 Standard 4: Leadership and Governance
2002 Standards

• a well-defined system of collegial governance including written policies outlining governance responsibilities of administration and faculty and readily available to the campus community;
• appropriate opportunity for student input regarding decisions that affect them;
• periodic assessment of the effectiveness of institutional leadership and governance
2002 Standards

- written governing documents, such as a constitution, by-laws, enabling legislation, charter or other similar documents, that:
  - delineate the governance structure and provide for collegial governance, and the structure’s composition, duties and responsibilities.
  - assign authority and accountability for policy development and decision making, including a process for the involvement of appropriate institutional constituencies in policy development and decision making;
2015 Standard 7: Governance, Leadership, and Administration
1. a clearly articulated and transparent governance structure that outlines roles, responsibilities, and accountability for decision making by each constituency, including governing body, administration, faculty, staff and students;

5. periodic assessment of the effectiveness of governance, leadership, and administration.
• New standards are less precise.

• Old standards provide additional context about expectations.

• Neither is prescriptive about models of shared governance, although sometimes the reference to governance is not clear as to whether it is the Board or the shared governance structure which is being referenced.

• Both contain additional information regarding responsibilities of the governing board and the Chief Executive Officer.

• Both contain an expectation that assessment of governance will take place.
Q: Which Standards involve Shared Governance?
A: All of them, but some more than others.
Requirements of Affiliation
8. The institution systematically evaluates its educational and other programs and makes public how well and in what ways it is accomplishing its purposes.
9. The institution’s student learning programs and opportunities are characterized by rigor, coherence, and appropriate assessment of student achievement throughout the educational offerings, **regardless of certificate or degree level or delivery and instructional modality.**
10. **Institutional planning** integrates goals for academic and institutional effectiveness and improvement, student achievement of educational goals, student learning, and the results of academic and institutional assessments.
Standard 1: Mission and Goals
1. clearly defined mission and goals that:
a. are developed through appropriate collaborative participation by all who facilitate or are otherwise responsible for institutional development and improvement;
Criteria

d. guide faculty, administration, staff, and governing structures in making decisions related to planning, resource allocation, program and curricular development, and the definition of institutional and educational outcomes;

e. include support of scholarly inquiry and creative activity, at levels and of the type appropriate to the institution;
3. goals that focus on student learning and related outcomes and on institutional improvement; are supported by administrative, educational, and student support programs and services; and are consistent with institutional mission; and

4. periodic assessment of mission and goals to ensure they are relevant and achievable.
• There is an expectation for appropriate participation in the development and review of mission and goals, particularly in areas related to student learning.
Standard 2: Ethics and Integrity
1. a commitment to academic freedom, intellectual freedom, freedom of expression, and respect for intellectual property rights;

2. a climate that fosters respect among students, faculty, staff, and administration from a range of diverse backgrounds, ideas, and perspectives;
6. honesty and truthfulness in public relations announcements, advertisements, recruiting and admissions materials and practices, as well as in internal communications;

8. compliance with all applicable federal, state, and Commission reporting policies…
   a. the full disclosure of information on institution-wide assessments, graduation, retention, certification and licensure or licensing board pass rates;
9. periodic assessment of ethics and integrity as evidenced in institutional policies, processes, practices, and the manner in which these are implemented.
Academic freedom, respect, truthfulness in communications, and transparency in reporting are integral components of Ethics and Integrity.

Regular assessment of these is expected.
Standard 4: Support of the Student Experience
1. clearly stated, ethical policies and processes to admit, retain, and facilitate the success of students whose interests, abilities, experiences, and goals provide a reasonable expectation for success and are compatible with institutional mission, including:
1b. a process by which students who are not adequately prepared for study at the level for which they have been admitted are identified, placed, and supported in attaining appropriate educational goals;

c. orientation, advisement, and counseling programs to enhance retention and guide students throughout their educational experience;
Criteria

d. processes designed to enhance the successful achievement of students’ educational goals including certificate and degree completion, transfer to other institutions, and post-completion placement;

2. policies and procedures regarding evaluation and acceptance of transfer credits, and credits awarded through experiential learning, prior non-academic learning, competency-based assessment, and other alternative learning approaches;
Remediation/developmental education, advisement, transfer, placement, evaluation of credit, policies which promote student success and provide for due process are all aspects of standard 4.

Regular assessment of these is expected.
Standard 6: Planning, Resources, and Institutional Improvement
1. institutional objectives, both institution-wide and for individual units, that are clearly stated, assessed appropriately, linked to mission and goal achievement, reflect conclusions drawn from assessment results, and are used for planning and resource allocation;

2. clearly documented and communicated planning and improvement processes that provide for constituent participation, and incorporate the use of assessment results;
4. fiscal and human resources as well as the physical and technical infrastructure adequate to support its operations wherever and however programs are delivered;

5. well-defined decision-making processes and clear assignment of responsibility and accountability;

9. periodic assessment of the effectiveness of planning, resource allocation, institutional renewal processes, and availability of resources.
Planning, resource allocation, and decision making based on assessment results, as well as participation of relevant constituencies is an integral part of this standard.

Regular assessment of these is expected.
Standard 3: Design and Delivery of the Student Learning Experience
Definitions
• Institutional Student Learning Outcomes: Required of all students except those in certificate programs. May be the same as MSCHE gen ed, but may also include additional disciplines or competencies. (Sustainability is an example of this.)
Definitions

- Institutional Goals: Strategic Goals for the institution. May or may not include student learning. Example: Review institutional policies, processes, and procedures to increase access to adult learners.
MSCHE General Education: quantitative and scientific reasoning, oral and written communication, critical analysis and reasoning, technological competency, information literacy, global awareness and cultural sensitivity. Required of all students except those in certificate programs. Must be mapped and assessed. No credit requirement.
SUNY General Education: 7/10 Categories, two competencies, and 30 credits in AA and AS degrees, and in baccalaureate degrees in the first two years of study.

- Does not require scientific reasoning.
- Does not require values, ethics, or diverse perspectives.
- Does not require SUNY GER of all degree programs.
• Program Learning Outcomes: after completing the academic program, students should be able to demonstrate these outcomes and competencies.

• Program Outcomes: Typically include completion data such as graduation rates and placement rates. The government includes such factors as loan default rates as well.
Definitions

Core Values

• May reflect institutional goals which are not student learning goals, depending on institutional mission.

• For example: Sustainability as a core value may be reflected in the physical plant, via recycling, solar energy, etc. without necessarily being included as a learning outcome in all degree programs.
ISLOs: Sources in the standards
Institutional Student Learning Outcomes (ISLOs) are not new requirements. These have been part of Standard 14 and are now part of the new Standard V.
Standard 14:
“Clearly articulated statements of expected student learning outcomes … at all levels (institution, degree/program, course) …that are: Appropriately integrated with one another, consonant with the institution’s mission; and consonant with the standards of higher education and of the relevant disciplines.”

Standard V:
“Clearly stated educational goals at the institution and degree/program levels which are interrelated with one another, with relevant educational experiences, and with the institution’s mission.”
Standard I: Mission and Goals

1. clearly defined mission and goals that...
   d. guide faculty, administration, staff, and governing structures in making decisions related to planning, resource allocation, program and curricular development, and the definition of institutional and educational outcomes;

3. goals that focus on student learning and related outcomes and on institutional improvement... and are consistent with institutional mission;
General Education Student Learning Outcomes (GELOs)
Standard III:

at institutions that offer undergraduate education, a general education program, freestanding or integrated into academic disciplines that:

a. offers a sufficient scope to draw students into new areas of intellectual experience, expanding their global awareness and cultural sensitivity, and preparing them to make well-reasoned judgments outside as well as within their academic field;
Standard III:
at institutions that offer undergraduate education, a general education program, freestanding or integrated into academic disciplines that:

b. offers a curriculum designed so that students acquire and demonstrate essential skills including at least oral and written communication, scientific and quantitative reasoning, critical analysis and reasoning, technological competency, and information literacy. Consistent with mission, the general education program also includes the study of values, ethics, and diverse perspectives.”

For graduate and professional education (new and current standards), “opportunities for the development of research, scholarship, and independent thinking…” are required.
The Expectations

- 15 credits of gen ed for associate degrees, 30 credits for baccalaureate degrees, **or the equivalent**. (New standards do not include credit amounts.)

- It is not necessary for gen ed to be delivered within programs or courses; alternative methods of delivery are permissible.

- You have to be able to demonstrate how all students are able to obtain instruction in these outcomes. You must also be able to assess them. Curriculum maps should demonstrate how all students access these and how they are assessed. This is about program design and not student choice.

- Program learning outcomes are not the same as general education outcomes or ISLOs. They may be limited to programs only.

- Certificate programs are not included in this expectation.
SUNY Gen Ed

- Requires 30 credits of gen ed in the first two years of study
- Requires Basic Communication and Mathematics
- Requires 5 of remaining 8 categories
- Requires 2 competencies
- Includes SUNY GER learning outcomes in Gen Ed assessment
- Requires waiver of local or programmatic requirements for transfer students who complete the 30 credit SUNY GER, or who have met a SUNY GER area comparable to such a requirement.
• SUNY General Education: 7/10 Categories, two competencies, and 30 credits in AA and AS degrees, and in baccalaureate degrees in the first two years of study.

• Does not require scientific reasoning.

• Does not require values, ethics, or diverse perspectives.

• Does not require global awareness and cultural sensitivity.

• Does not require SUNY GER of all degree programs.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SUNY GER Categories</th>
<th>MSCHE Categories which will be met</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Basic Communication (Written and Oral)</td>
<td>Written and Oral Communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mathematics</td>
<td>Quantitative Reasoning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critical Thinking</td>
<td>Critical Analysis and Reasoning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Management</td>
<td>Information Literacy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SUNY GER Categories</th>
<th>MSCHE Categories which may be met</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Natural Science</td>
<td>Scientific Reasoning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Science</td>
<td>Scientific Reasoning, Diverse Perspectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American History</td>
<td>Diverse perspectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Civilization</td>
<td>Global Awareness, Cultural Sensitivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other World Civilizations</td>
<td>Diverse Perspectives, Global Awareness, Cultural Sensitivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign Language</td>
<td>Values, Ethics, Diverse Perspectives, Global Awareness, Cultural Sensitivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humanities</td>
<td>Values, Ethics, Diverse Perspectives, Global Awareness, Cultural Sensitivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Arts</td>
<td>Diverse Perspectives, Global Awareness, Cultural Sensitivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Communication</td>
<td>Technological Competency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Management</td>
<td>Technological Competency</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Program Student Learning Outcomes (PLOs)
The Expectations

• Program student learning outcomes are ‘clearly articulated written statements, expressed in observable terms, of key learning outcomes: the knowledge, skills and competencies that students are expected to exhibit upon completion of the program.’ (Characteristics of Excellence)

• These should be published for each program in the college catalog.
Course Student Learning Outcomes (CLOs)
The Expectations

- Course student learning outcomes form the basis of course level learning and should be indicated in all course syllabi.

- Although Middle States does not specifically require course level assessment, this frequently provides a format for assessment of other outcomes at the gen ed, program, and institutional levels.
Assessment of Everything
Standard 5: Educational Effectiveness Assessment
2. organized and systematic assessments, conducted by faculty and/or appropriate professionals, **evaluating the extent of student achievement of institutional and degree/program goals**. Institutions should:

a. define meaningful curricular goals with defensible standards for evaluating whether students are achieving those goals;

(n.b. “defensible standards” means that other professionals in the discipline might reasonably expect to find that the assessment process yields a realistic and valid understanding of student learning. E.g. does a single multiple choice question yield credible, meaningful results?)
SUNY policy is to meet or exceed Middle States expectations.

Program Review was established to formalize assessment cycles at 5-7 years. This expectation is for program outcomes rather than program learning outcomes.

Program Learning Outcomes, General Education Learning Outcomes and Institutional Learning Outcomes should be assessed systematically and regularly. This is typically done through course level assessment or through capstone projects or internships and the like.
1. Connecting the dots among all levels of SLOs.

2. Ensuring that the learning outcomes are broad enough and specific enough to be meaningful and measurable.

3. Ensuring that assessment results for student learning are also used for planning and resource allocation at the institutional and unit levels.

4. Assessing some standards may be particularly difficult due to lack of relevant methodology.
Expectations are for a “mature” assessment program

- Curricular offerings must be assessed consistently regardless of level, location or modality.

- General education and/or ISLOs must also be assessed, whether they are delivered within courses or in an extracurricular or co-curricular manner. In this case, mapping is especially important.

- There must be evidence of results being used to improve teaching and learning (assessment spiral).

- At least two full cycles of assessment and the use of results are expected to meet the standard.
How do you know?

and

How do you show?
Summary
Summary

• Although Middle States is not prescriptive about models of shared governance, the standards provide considerable guidance for determining its effectiveness, as well as guidance for the types of elements for which inclusion of shared governance processes would be appropriate.

• All of the standards as well as the Requirements of Affiliation include implications for shared governance.
Resources
Current Standards
http://www.msche.org/publications/RevisedStandardsFINAL.pdf

Former Standards (Characteristics of Excellence)
Additional Resources

- Middle States Publications for Institutional Improvement
- SCoA Institutional Effectiveness Rubric
Discussion